Volunteer Cleanup of Abandoned Mines: Barriers & Liabilities

Presentation # 2 to the Workshop on Legal & Institutional Barriers to Collaboration
Ottawa – February 24, 2003
By
Joseph F. Castrilli
Barrister & Solicitor
Toronto, Ontario

Introduction
♦ Presentation # 1 provided overview of July 2002 report on barriers, liabilities, & opportunities for collaboration in volunteer abandoned mine cleanup
♦ Presentation # 2 re-states the form taken by, & issues raised with respect to:
  – Legislative & institutional barriers; &
  – Liability disincentives

Legislative & Institutional Barriers
♦ A barrier to volunteer abatement may be a requirement under statute/regulation that imposes obligation on volunteer to do, not do, or obtain something if want to proceed
♦ The thing may be a licence, permit, approval, or standard that applies generally to regulated industry
♦ Should volunteer meet same/different requirements as rest of regulated industry?

Legislative & Institutional Barriers: Federal
♦ Potential barriers under federal law:
  – Licensing requirements under natural resource management laws in northern Canada
  – Regulations under Fisheries Act
  – Pollution prevention plans under CEPA
  – EA requirements under CEAA
  – Uranium mining requirements for abandoned sites under NSCA
Legislative & Institutional Barriers: Provincial

Potential barriers under provincial law include requirements for obtaining and complying with:
- Approvals
- Licences
- Permits
- Plans
- Regulations

Liability Disincentives

A liability disincentive to volunteer abatement may arise from the violation of the common law (judge-made law), civil law, legislative, or regulatory provisions and may result in the imposition of fines, monetary compensation obligations, obligations to do, or refrain from doing, something or, in extreme circumstances, imprisonment.

Liability Disincentives: Types

Three primary types of liability:
- Administrative
- Civil
- Criminal/quasi-criminal/regulatory

See Glossary for definitions

Liability Disincentives: Scope

Allocative
- Obligation to provide compensation on the basis of level of contribution to problem

Joint & Several
- Obligation to provide 100% of compensation on each person found liable for any portion of problem
Barriers & Liability: Some Issues

- Legislative barriers – should volunteer meet same/different requirements as regulated industry? What factors to be considered?
- Institutional barriers – are ad hoc approaches in absence of legislative reform adequate?
- Liability – should volunteer face same/different liability risks as regulated industry? What factors to be considered?